

The Economics of Culture and Cultural Statistics in South Africa

**Haroon Borat &
Mei-Chi Liou**

**Development Policy
Research Unit,
University of Cape Town**



The Economics of Culture & Cultural Statistics in South Africa

Introduction

The realisation that culture plays a vital role in areas as diverse as understanding economic performance and development and individual behaviour patterns has led to social scientists searching for appropriate indicators of culture in an economy. This paper tries to define culture and then explore the arguments about why culture is important. Different cultural characteristics that either positively or negatively affect economic growth are then briefly touched on. Unfortunately data is scarce and fragmented in South Africa, so we take a look at the quality of existing cultural statistics in South Africa as well as the potential indicators of culture's contribution to an economy. Hoping to learn from others who have faced these same problems before, international experience is examined and conclusions and recommendations are finally drawn.

Definition and Significance of Culture and Its Industries

Globally, culture has received more recognition and attention in recent years. Many countries for example Canada, Australia, UK, Philippines, Italy, France, have realised the importance and value of the contribution of the culture and its industries. Amartya Sen, the 1998 winner of the Nobel Prize for economics for his contributions to welfare economics is an avid proponent of the idea that culture matters¹. In fact, the debate is no longer whether culture is important but rather where and how culture can contribute to the sociological and economic well being of individuals. This paper focuses on the economic and perhaps more tangible aspects of culture although this does not and should not suggest that the economic consequences of culture are more important than non-economic aspects of culture.

The immediate point of departure is to understand exactly what defines "culture" or the "cultural industry". The World Bank has two definitions of "culture". The first, broader definition of culture describes "particular shared values, beliefs, knowledge, skills and practices that underpin behaviour by members of a social group at a particular point in time" (World Bank, 2002). The second, more narrow definition describes the "creative expression, skills, traditional knowledge and cultural resources that form part of the lives of people and societies and can be a basis for social engagement and enterprise development" and would include craft and design, oral and written history, literature, music, drama, dance, visual arts, architectural forms, historic sites etc (World Bank, 2002). The first definition is useful when one speaks of "psychological" or social aspects of an individual's actions are to an extent influenced by one's culture while the second more narrow definition would be useful when discussing the "fruits" of culture and the more tangible manifestations of culture. It is this second definition that essentially encapsulates the "cultural industry".

¹ For example his paper presented at the 2000 World Bank Tokyo Meeting called "Culture and Development" and "How does Culture Matter" found in a forthcoming book "Culture and Public Action" edited by Vijayendra Rao and Michael Walton (currently available from the website: www.cultureandpublication.org).

Although the purpose of this paper is more focused on specific industries, it is still important to have a general understanding of the debate around the relevance of culture. In this section, we briefly outline and provide examples of how culture matters.

Despite the current financial crisis in East Asia, its economic achievements and progress in the past few decades remains impressive (Sen, 2001). These remarkable achievements brought about new theories on the role of culture in achieving this success (Sen, 2001). As a value-based explanation of economic growth, it is hard to pinpoint and in particular quantify the role of culture. Nevertheless it would be unwise to disregard culture simply because one is unable to easily attach a number to it.

Huntington (2000) gives an example of two countries, Ghana and South Korea, both of which were very similar economically, in the early 1960's. Both countries had roughly the same levels of per capita GNP, a similar breakdown in terms of primary products, manufacturing and services, and exports comprising mainly primary products (with Korea producing a few manufactured goods) and both countries were receiving comparable levels of economic aid (Huntington, 2000, p.xiii). Thirty years later, South Korea grew to become an "industrial giant" with one of the top fifteen largest economies in the world, had multinational corporations and were major exporters of automobiles and electronic equipment (Huntington, 2000, p.xiii). Ghana on the other hand experienced none of these changes and their GNP was about a fifteenth of that of South Korea's; and while a multitude of factors played a role, Huntington (2000) believes that culture had to be a large part of the explanation, for example, South Koreans valued thrift, investment, hard work, education, organisation, and discipline while Ghanaians had other values. Huntington (2000) came to the conclusion that culture counts.

Economists believe that given appropriate economic policy that is effectively implemented, countries will produce the same results without any reference to culture; however there are multicultural countries in which certain ethnic groups do better than others despite operating within the same economic environment (Harris, 2000). Examples of this include the Chinese minorities in East and Southeast Asia, the Indians in East Africa, Lebanese in West Africa, Japanese in Brazil and the United States and the Jews wherever they have migrated (Landes, 2000, p.2). It is important though to remember that culture is not an independent variable and that it may be influenced by other factors such as geography, climate, politics and history (Harris, 2000).

Culture and economics are therefore linked, and because of this, changes in one will invariably work back on the other. In Thailand for example, all good young men used to spend years serving a religious apprenticeship in Buddhist monasteries, a period of ripening good for the soul and spirit but also suitable for the slow, relaxed pace of traditional economic activity and employment (Landes, 2000, p.3). Today, Thailand is busier, faster with thriving commerce and bustling economic activity. Time has become an expensive commodity and as a result, Thais spiritualise for a few weeks and return to the real world (Landes, 2000). In this case, time has changed in relative value and Thais have voluntarily changed their priorities, an example of how economics have affected culture (Landes, 2000). The opposite may also occur;

culture may affect economics. Landes (2000, p.3) noted that in Russia, seventy-five years of "anti-market, anti-profit schooling, and insider privilege have planted and frozen anti-entrepreneurial attitudes" and even after the fallen regime people are afraid of market uncertainty, preferring the safety and security of state employment. The collapse of the Marxist prohibitions and inhibitions has led to a rush of business activity, but those benefiting from this are usually non-Russian minorities such as the Georgians, Armenians, etc. (Landes, 2000).

Grondona (2000) tries to isolate certain values that may improve or diminish a nation's chances of developing and compiles a list of twenty contrasting cultural factors that may either be favourable or resistant to economic development. Three of these are presented below² (Grondona, 2000, p.47).

- **Religion** – Religion has been the richest source of values, and there are two types of religion, "publican" (a religion that showed a preference for the poor over the rich) and "pharisaic" (a preference for the rich and successful). Hence where a publican religion is dominant, economic development will be difficult as the poor feel justified in their poverty and the rich feel uncomfortable as sinners. On the other hand, in a pharisaic region where followers celebrate their success as evidence of God's blessing or lack of success as God's condemnation, both the rich and poor have a strong incentive to improve their condition through accumulation and investment.
- **Trust in the Individual** – The principle instrument of economic development is the work of individuals. A climate of liberty that leaves individuals in control of their own destiny is crucial in inducing one to improve and invent. If people feel that others are responsible for them, the effort of these individuals will diminish. Also if others tell them what to think and believe, there will either be submission or rebellion, neither of which is conducive to development since submission results in loss of innovators and rebellion results in diversion of energy away from constructive effort to resistance and destruction.
- **The Moral Imperative** – There are three basic levels of morality, ranging from altruism and self-denial (such as that of saints and martyrs) to criminal (having disregard for the rights of others or the law). The intermediate level of morality is when the individual engages in neither saintly nor criminal behaviour, and merely seeks his or her own well being within the limits of social responsibility and the law. Thus in development-favourable cultures, there is widespread compliance with laws and norms that are not very demanding or difficult and are therefore easy to realise. In development-resistant cultures, there are two worlds that are out of touch with each other, one with the highest standards and the other with immorality and hypocrisy, with law becoming a remote ideal that does little more than express what people might in theory prefer.

The above are just some of the values or cultural factors that are able to enhance or impede economic development. Others include concepts of wealth, competition, justice, value of work, utility, rationality, authority, visions of democracy etc.

² For the extended list, look in Grondona, M., (2000): "A Cultural Typology of Economic Development" in Harrison, L.E. & Huntington, S.P., (Ed) (2000) Culture Matters. New York, Basic Books

(Grondona, 2000). Obviously this list is neither definitive nor exhaustive; there are many factors that may influence these values or the strength of their impact, this just gives the reader a taste of how important culture is in terms of economic growth.

The concept of culture has previously been seen as rather vague and regarded as unimportant. This section has shown that economists have finally come to realise the importance of culture and its remarkable ability to influence not only the lives of individuals but also that of an entire economy.

The literature on culture is broad, vast and fast growing, but since the main purpose of this paper is to take a more specific look at cultural industries, we move away from the broader idea of the definition of culture and return to the narrow definition, i.e. the "fruits" of culture and why it is important to understand and promote its activities.

Think of any historical site such as Robben Island in the Cape or the Voortrekker Monument in Pretoria South Africa. From the Pyramids to the Great Wall of China, large sums of revenue are generated, all due to the fact that they form part of the culture and history of a place. Think also of the local arts and crafts markets, museums, plays, music etc; the list of cultural activities and industries goes on. It becomes quite obvious that cultural activities and objects give economic remuneration (Sen, 2002), and there are many activities that may be directly or indirectly dependent on cultural facilities and "cultural environment" (Sen, 2002, p.3). For example the drinks vendor or curio shop near the Van Gogh Museum. Culture and its industries form an integral part of our lives and without it, many will be adversely affected either directly or indirectly. Beyond economic remuneration, culture is important as it forms a part of one's heritage and identity as a person, and it is vital that it is preserved, maintained and protected for future generations to come.

At this point it would be useful to mention that there is much contention as to whether cultural sites (also includes religious sites) should be used to generate income and that perhaps commercialism would erode such a site, but Sen (2002) makes the point that even after excluding commercial uses that may be threatening there are still many other indirect opportunities. At the same time, revenue is required to maintain the sites and usually the only way to fund this is through tourism.

There is no clear distinction between cultural tourism and tourism on its own. Generally there is an overlap in tourist activities and it is virtually impossible to separate the two. In fact there is even difficulty in identifying whether an activity should be categorised as cultural or not. A prime example of this would be tourists visiting the Kruger National Park. Usually, when one mentions "Africa", a person conjures up images of the rich earth with all sorts of wild and majestic animals roaming the land and the sound of African drumbeats in the distance. One may argue that a visit to see the wild life and natural environment in the park is a cultural visit as it encapsulates all that is African, past, present and future. However another could argue that it has nothing to do with culture at all and perhaps the reason for the visit was just to see the lions or elephants in their natural habitat. The purpose of this argument is to show that firstly the line between what is cultural and not is blurred and secondly that there are more cultural issues that factor into our lives than we realise.

Having established that culture is important for the economy, the question arises as to how one would actually go ahead and measure culture and its industries. The next section will take a critical look at what little existing cultural statistics there are in South Africa and present some of the findings. This is followed by a section on what other countries have developed internationally in terms of understanding and developing economic indicators for measuring culture from which we may hopefully learn. Finally, this paper will propose ways and means of collecting relevant data for our own set of cultural economic indicators.

Existing Cultural Statistics in South Africa

Before we examine existing statistics in South Africa, let's take a look at the type of statistics that are good indicators of culture's importance and contribution to an economy.

One way of measuring the size of an industry is by examining the number of people that the industry provides. For example, tracking employment levels in the music industry is an obvious starting point. However, as with any statistic, one needs to take into consideration other factors that would affect it. Technological improvements may cause a movement toward more capital-intensive methods, which would reduce the number of employees, but this does not necessarily mean that the industry has shrunk, in fact with greater efficiencies it may contribute more in terms of value.

This brings us to the next indicator of culture; the amount of income or output an industry generates, usually measured as a percentage of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (Melo, 2001). This involves adding up the value of all the products of a particular industry in preferably real terms (to isolate inflationary effects) and seeing how much it contributes to the economy and whether it changes over time.

These indicators are perhaps the two main and simplest indicators of the size and strength of an industry. In practice and in particular in our case, it would be very difficult to generate one single number that encapsulates the entire cultural industry, mainly because data is scarce and fragmented. Due to the fact that variables are not necessarily categorised or defined in the same way in different data sets, it would be extremely dangerous to simply aggregate these numbers to create a single employment or contribution to GDP number.

Other indicators include things like circulation of newspapers, number of book titles published, radios per thousand people, and distribution by type of music etc. Incidentally, the World Culture Report actually has some of this data on South Africa from sources such as UNESCO, United Nations Population Division (UNPOP), World Trade Organisation (WTO), United Nations Statistical Division (UNSTAT) and the International Labour Organisation (ILO). The data though is fragmented and scarce.

In comparison with the developed world, cultural research and analysis is relatively new and under-developed in South Africa. This is a problem that is shared with countries such as Venezuela, India, China and Columbia (De Leon, 2002). In recent years, the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC) (previously called the Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology (DACST)) commissioned several reports in an attempt to better understand the cultural industries and to enhance the economic

and social benefits of arts and culture. The Cultural Industries Growth Strategy (CIGS) in particular was a project that concentrated on developing strategies for growth and development within the various industries and included in-depth studies on four main industries, namely the music industry, craft, publishing, and the film and television industries (DACST, 1998). Each industry was individually and intensively covered. *Unless otherwise referenced*, these reports contain gathered data and form the bulk of cultural data that is available today. In this section, we take a critical look at the presented data

The Cultural Strategy Group (CSG) (1998, p.10) defines cultural industries as consisting of the following:

- Music (classical, popular, folklore)
- The visual arts (painting, sculpture, public arts and the decorative arts)
- The publishing sector based on writing and literature (books, magazines, newspapers)
- The audio-visual and media sector (film, television, photography, video, broadcasting)
- The performing arts (theatre, dance, opera, live music)
- The emerging multimedia sector (combining sound, text and image)
- Crafts (traditional art, designer goods, craft-art, functional wares and souvenirs)
- Cultural tourism
- The cultural heritage sector (museums, heritage sites and cultural events such as festivals and commemorations)
- Design
- Industrial design and fashion and
- The graphic arts (including advertising)

They have chosen to focus on four main sectors; namely music, film and television, publishing and craft sectors. These four sectors are then thoroughly analysed and results are clearly presented. It would however be easy to come to an erroneous conclusion that these industries are the only important components of the cultural industry. Cultural tourism for example is a one of the fastest growing industries in South Africa and should be taken seriously; but as mentioned earlier the line between cultural tourism and tourism is blurred thus making it more difficult to isolate and measure compared to the other sectors. Although the cultural heritage and performing and visual arts sectors are comparatively smaller than the four main sectors, these are considered a primary or more traditional source of culture which should be invested in, preserved and developed.

Having decided to focus on the four sectors, the CSG proceeded to tackle the task of researching each industry in depth. Global trends were fully investigated before focussing on the South African industries by looking at the structure of each sector and performing SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats) analysis. Finally policy recommendations for the development of the various cultural industries were brought forward.

As the purpose of this paper is to consider the economics and statistics of the cultural industries in South Africa, it takes a closer look the CSG's section on the South African industries. Wonderfully written and compiled reports, perhaps their only

shortcomings are not the statistics but rather the *lack of and difficulty* in obtaining statistics.

Lack of statistics is particularly a problem in the craft industry mainly because it consists of smaller, very "fluid" and often informal businesses that do not pay tax nor form part of unions etc (CSG, 1998). The information gathered on the craft industry is hence more qualitative than quantitative and highly dependant on interviews with persons involved within the craft industry. This does not mean that the data was not useful for constructive policy formulation, however it does mean that although the statistics collected gave an idea of what the sector looked like, there is no reliable estimate of the true size or strength of the sector. There is also no way of comparing these statistics regularly as one would with a more formalised method of data capture.

The CSG (1998) divides the publishing industry into (1) print media, (2) book publishing and (3) electronic publishing. Print media in turn is divided into magazines and newspapers and since print media is predominantly driven by advertising revenue, the CSG uses it to give an indication of how the sector has grown from the period 1997 to 1998. There are only a few key players in the magazine and newspaper industry. This makes it easier to obtain data and makes the data more reliable. Book publishing was divided into (a) educational, (b) academic and (3) general & trade books. Since government budget spending on educational books, data is more readily available, for example provincial spending on textbooks. The value of textbook manufacturing was also given as a proxy, however one should be careful in using nominal versus volume indicators since the nominal value is dependant on inflation rates etc. While academic books target mainly Technikon and Unisa students, there seems to be a surprising lack of data in this regard. Examples of general and trade books companies are given however sector wide data is not available. In terms of electronic publishing, on-line publishing is distinguished between CD ROM publishing. Whereas international data is readily available, South African data for these two types of electronic publishing was also unobtainable. A paper by Naumann, Hatzenberg and Mlatsheni (2002) on the MAPPP (Media, Advertising, Publishing, Printing and Packaging) sectors was able to give an overview, however they too found difficulties with Statistics South Africa (StatsSA) data in that there was an overlap in the data (e.g. "media" would include printed media such as newspapers and magazines whereas these same outputs are also encountered within "printed" materials) and data was unavailable within the broader categories (e.g. the advertising industry exists in terms of being classified in the MAPPP SETA, however there is no data available (Naumann et al, 2002, p.6). Also, for our purposes, the "packaging" section is non-relevant and "printing" includes items such as roll label production, envelope and stationary production etc, which are not considered items pertaining to culture. The broad indicators that were presented included the value of annual sales, capital expenditure on new assets and imports and exports for each of the variables, yet one would be hesitant to compare these numbers; for instance the value of annual sales of publishing with the "same" number from the Creative South Africa report. "Publishing" in the MAPPP SETA report includes publishing of books and other publications that do not have advertising as a component, while "publishing" in Creative SA includes magazines, newspapers, books, CD ROMs and online publications. It is clear that the reason is the recurring problem of differences in how one defines a variable and one should be constantly

aware and cautious. Ideally, cultural indicators should come from one source, and if this is not possible, the different indicators should at least come from the same source.

The international film and television industry is well documented in the CIGS paper and the overview given allows the reader to understand exactly how the SA industry works. South Africa's entertainment industry was worth approximately R7.4 billion and forms 1.75% of GDP according to Merrill Lynch in 1997 and consisted of the broadcasting, cinematic, music and interactive industries (CIGS, 1998). While this is useful, one may immediately see the overlap between this indicator with the findings in the music paper. This is a prime example of one of the problems with cultural statistics which is the difficulty in separating the data. Notwithstanding this, the information is still useful. There are good statistics from the SABC (South African Broadcasting Corporation) such as the number of production contracts commissioned over the period 1991 to 1996. This gives us a sense of whether the industry has grown as well as the profitability or turnover that is involved in television productions. There is also a breakdown of turnover, for example cinema, video, television etc and an estimate of the size and growth of the broadcasting industry, however there is no distinction between local production and international production, in other words, one is unable to establish whether capital flows remain in or leave South Africa.

The music industry is also dominated by a few key players, but while these players have supplied international information, once again South Africa specific data was lacking. Given certain assumptions e.g. retailers indicate that their profit margins were between 10% and 20%, the CSG estimated the gross turnover of the music industry, however the exact method of these calculations is not given. While these numbers are estimated, should the same methodology be employed continuously over the years, it does give some indication of the general direction of trends even though the numbers may not be exact. The Association of South African Music Industry (ASAMI) or the Recording Industry of South Africa (RISA) as it is now called provides in depth information on their members in terms of real and nominal sales for 2000. As mentioned previously a few players dominate the SA music industry and therefore RISA's figures are useful; however one should remember that there are other components of the music industry such as performing artists, live concerts etc. that are not captured. There is also no way of knowing whether royalties are kept in South Africa or not. Nominal import and export numbers of CD's and cassettes were also obtained from Customs and Excise.

The South African cultural industry is firstly very difficult to define and second (partly due to the first) very difficult to measure and quantify and at this point it becomes clear that it is virtually impossible to come up with a single number that tells us the size of culture and its contribution to the economy. Breaking down culture into its various different industries and then measuring their contribution is an option but highly dependant on the classifications of what constitutes an industry; also many factors of culture may be left out of the analysis. Taking the second best option of measuring the industries we have classified, further problems present themselves. This is the problem of data. There is no single official source of data. While there exists data within an industry (for example data collected by various organisations or associations), these are often selective towards membership of the organisation collecting the data. This means that there is some form of bias present. Even though

this is a problem, if data collection is consistent this still gives the reader an indication of how the members of a certain association is performing and one may assume that these trends are industry wide. This is sufficient if one would like a general indication of trends in the country, however comparisons with cultural indicators internationally should be avoided or at least done with great care.

Notwithstanding the data problems, we take a look at the CSG findings in the table below. The CSG paper estimates that cultural industries contribute to 17% of total employment. The music industry was worth R2 billion and shown to grow 70.7% during the period 1992 to 1996 and the publishing industry at about 17% recently. Also film and television contributed R5.8 billion to the total value or worth of the entire entertainment industry, which was about R7.4 billion. Also the entertainment industry was approximated to be around 20 525. If one were to assume the proportion of value to employment to be equal between the total entertainment industry and film and television, then the film and television industry would employ about 16 090 workers. The craft industry employs 20 000 and the publishing sector between 60 and 80 000 workers.

Table 1: Summary table of CSG findings

	Music	Film and television	Publishing	Craft
Growth	70.7% 1992-1996	-	17% recently (date unknown)	-
Worth	R2 bn	R5.8 bn (Film and TV) R7.4 bn (Totl entert. Indus.)	-	-
Employment	12 000	20 525 (Totl entert indus)	60 - 80 000	20 000

The Standard Industrial Classifications (SIC) is an internationally accepted method of breaking down industrial activities into many levels/tiers and this would be the most promising source of data, however as the MAPPP sets researchers (previously mentioned) found when exploring advertising, while the SIC may classify an industry, this does not necessarily mean data is available or useful. To illustrate, look at Table 1 below.

Table 1 below looks specifically at major division 9: Community, social and personal services. This seems to be a promising place to look for cultural data. Indeed when one looks at the breakdown of major division 9, we find "recreational, cultural and sporting activities". This too is encouraging. Going further we discover motion pictures, television, radio, libraries and even historical sites and botanical gardens, all variables that we are interested in. The problem arises when one tries to find the data in the various databases. Both the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and Census 2000 publishes only data up to the second level, i.e. two digit SIC codes even though their raw data goes down to the three digit level albeit incomplete. This means that we are only able to look at the aggregate "recreational, cultural and sporting activities" (or SIC96) numbers (Table 1), in other words, one is unable to look at the individual components. Also, while aggregate numbers are useful, the category includes "sports" and there is no way of separating its effects. Looking at the LFS September 2000 raw data, we were able to look at three digit variables and could ascertain the number of people working in each industry (SIC961-4), however when we tried to look at the income of those respondents, all of them were recorded as "Not applicable". In other words, only certain sections/variables of the data were available.

Table 2: Standard Industrial Classification of all Economic Activities - Extract

	Division	Major Group	Group	Sub-Group	Title of Category
1					Major Division 1: Agriculture, Hunting, Forestry and Fishing
2					Major Division 2: Mining and Quarrying
3					Major Division 3: Manufacturing
4					Major Division 4: Electricity, Gas and Water Supply
5					Major Division 5: Construction
6					Major Division 6: Wholesale and Retail Trade; repair of motor vehicles, motor cycles and personal goods and household goods; hotels and restaurants
7					Major Division 7: Transport, Storage and Communication
8					Major Division 8: Financial intermediation insurance, real estate and business services
9					Major Division 9: Community, social and personal services
	91				Public administration and defense activities
	92				Education
	93				Health and social work
	94				Other community, social and personal service activities
	95				Activities of membership organizations
	96				Recreational, cultural and sporting activities
		961			Motion picture, radio, television and other entertainment activities
			9611		Motion picture and video production and distribution
				96111	Motion picture and video production and distribution
				96112	Related activities, film and tape renting to other industries, booking, delivery and storage
			9612		Motion picture projection
				96121	Motion picture projection by cinemas
				96122	Motion picture projection by drive-in cinemas
			9613		Radio and television activities
			9614		Dramatic arts, music and other arts activities
			9619		Other entertainment activities
		962	9620	96200	News agency activities
		963			Library, archives, museums and other cultural activities
			9631	96310	Library and archives activities
			9632	96320	Museum activities and preservation of historical sites and buildings
			9633	96330	Botanical and zoological gardens and nature reserve activities
		964			Sporting and other recreational activities
			9641	96410	Sporting activities
			9649	96490	Other recreational activities
	99				Other Service Activities
0					Major Division 0: Private households, ex-territorial organisations, representatives or foreign governments and other activities not adequately defined

Source: Central Statistical Service (now known as Statistics South Africa (StatsSA))

In our attempt to find a variable, any variable; the Census was examined in depth. Of all the occupations listed, only two were culturally related: (1) Handicraft, printing and related trades workers and (2) Other craft and related trades workers. Note that both are double-digit classifications and while it is broken down further to the third level, that data is unavailable to us. We were able to find the number of workers in

Census data not useful

these two categories as well as their age, gender, race, industry, income group and province in which they reside.

The "handicraft, printing and related trades workers" include "handicraft, printing and related trades workers not further defined", "precision workers in metal and related materials", "potters, glass-makers and related trades workers", "handicraft workers in wood, textile, leather and related materials", "printing and related trades workers" and "handicraft, printing and related trades workers not elsewhere classified".

The "other craft and related trades workers" include "other craft and related trades workers not further defined", "food processing and related trades workers", "wood treaters, cabinet makers and related trades workers", "textile, garment and related trades workers", "pelt, leather and shoemaking trades workers" and "other craft and related trades workers not elsewhere classified".

Table 3: Gender by Occupation - Census 1996

Gender by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
Male	52,581	93,279	145,860
Female	16,015	108,568	124,581
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441

We are able to say that about 270 500 people work in these two occupations, most of them in "other craft and related trades workers". The majority of the people working in the "handicraft, printing and related trades" are male while females dominate in the category "other craft and related trade workers".

Table 4: Population Group by Occupation - Census 1996

Population Group by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
African/Black	35,722	137,575	173,297
Coloured	13,628	32,941	46,569
Indian/Asian	4,870	11,641	16,511
White	13,538	17,890	31,428
Unspecified	838	1,798	2,636
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441

The bulk of workers in these two categories are African/Black, followed by Coloured (forming only about a third of African's), then Indian/Asian and White workers. In terms of their age and geographic positioning (looking in Appendix A, Table A1 and A2), we see that most of them are between the ages of 25 and 44, a result that is not surprising and live predominantly in Gauteng (86 663 workers) and the Western Cape (46 994 workers).

Table 4 below looks at the industry that these workers fall under and the majority are manufacturing and wholesale and retail trade workers. This could be problematic as one sees that "other craft and related trades workers incorporates "textiles, garment

and related trades" workers. This means that someone working in a jersey factory would possibly be included. The question that we should ask is whether or not this constitutes as a cultural activity, and the answer is that it seems unlikely.

Table 5: Industry by Occupation - Census 1996

Industry by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
Agriculture, hunting, forestry and fishing	471	4,304	4,775
Mining and quarrying	3,198	731	3,929
Manufacturing	39,642	122,114	161,756
Electricity, gas and water supply	228	233	461
Construction	5,984	1,933	7,917
Wholesale and retail trade	5,308	44,846	50,153
Transport, storage and communication	816	1,342	2,160
Financial, insurance, real estate and business services	2,853	2,116	4,969
Community, social and personal services	3,719	5,330	9,049
Private households	567	3,381	3,948
Exterritorial organisations	25	22	47
Representatives of foreign governments	13	16	29
Industry NEC or unspecified	5,770	15,478	21,248
Not applicable	-	-	-
NA: Institution	-	-	-
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441

Table 6: Individual Income by Occupation - Census 1996

Individual income by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
None	601	2,301	2,902
R1 - R200	3,107	16,952	20,059
R201 - R500	7,035	40,234	47,269
R501 - R1000	12,156	53,963	66,119
R1001 - R1500	15,683	43,791	59,474
R1501 - R2500	11,989	22,479	34,468
R2501 - R3500	5,482	7,002	12,484
R3501 - R4500	3,292	3,473	6,765
R4501 - R6000	2,905	2,817	5,722
R6001 - R8000	1,812	1,400	3,212
R8001 - R11000	974	829	1,803
R11001 - R16000	448	439	887
R16001 - R30000	216	273	489
R30001 or more	86	116	202
Unspecified	2,830	5,778	8,606
NA: Institution	-	-	-
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441

Finally looking at the income of these earners, the bulk of these workers earn between R200 and R3500, indicating that these occupations are predominately less skilled

and/or education intensive. While this income information is interesting, what would be more helpful would be income information on the entire cultural industry. The total wage bill for cultural occupations could give us an idea of how large of a component the industry is and the income of individuals would be able to tell us whether the industry is equitable or not.

It is unfortunate that these are the only two culturally related occupations, but this lack of data is exact problem that we face. In the perfect world, in which data is freely available and one wished to construct an indicator based on the cultural sectors identified by the CSG; the following SICs should possibly be included, though it should be noted that this list is not by all means perfect: NOTE that a brief comment (where applicable) on certain variables and the problems that may be encountered is included in italics.

Table 7: Possible SIC components of a Cultural Indicator

SIC Codes	Title of Category	Description of Industries
SIC 324	Publishing	<p>This major group includes publishing whether or not connected with printing. Publishing involves financial, technical, artistic, legal and marketing activities, among others, but these activities are not predominant.</p> <p>The breakdown into groups is based on the type of printed matter or recorded media published.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>Printing is classified under group 3260.</p> <p>The reproduction of recorded media is classified under group 3260.</p> <p>The publishing of motion pictures and videotapes is classified under group 9611 and of computer software under group 8620.</p> <p>The preparation and production on a fee or contract basis of master copies for records or audio material are classified under group 9649.</p>
SIC 32410	Publishing of books, brochures, musical books and other publications	This group includes the publishing of books, textbooks, atlases and maps, brochures, pamphlets, musical works and other publications.
SIC 32420	Publishing of newspapers, journals and periodicals	This group includes the publishing of newspapers, journals and periodicals of a technical or general nature, including trade journals, comics etc.
SIC 32430	Publishing of recorded media	<p>This group includes the publishing of records and other recorded audio media.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>The publishing of motion pictures and videotapes is classified under group 9611</p>

		and of computer software under group 8620.
SIC 32490	Other publishing	<p>This group includes the publishing of photos, engravings and postcards, timetables, forms, posters, the reproduction of works of art, or other printed matters. This group also includes all micropublishing.</p> <p><i>Comment:</i> <i>While the reproduction of works or art may be considered "cultural", engravings and timetable for example cannot. The question that needs to be asked is whether this entire variable has sufficient "cultural" components or not and whether it should be included in the indicator.</i></p>
SIC 325	Printing and service activities related to printing	
SIC 32510	Printing	<p>This group includes the printing of newspapers, magazines, periodicals, journals, books, music pamphlets, maps, atlases, posters, playing cards and other material for others on a fee or contract basis, e.g. catalogues on account of machinery producers; postage, revenue stamps or currency on account of governments; books, albums, diaries, business forms etc., on account of stationers.</p> <p>Printing includes reproducing material by means of duplicating machines, computer controlled reproduction, embossers, photocopiers, or thermocopiers.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The printing of labels of paper or paperboard is classified under group 3239. The publishing of printed matter and printing by publishers is classified under major group 324. The production of original material by authors, musicians, engineers, architects and others is classified in the industry appropriate to their technical or artistic activity. Duplicating done as a business service (e.g. in copy shops) is classified under group 8899.</p> <p><i>Comment:</i> <i>Printing is a large component of</i></p>

		<i>publishing that is categorised on its own, while there are other activities that are not entirely considered cultural, the entire variable seems too important to omit.</i>
SIC 32520	Service activities related to printing	<p>This group includes bookbinding and other work related to bookbinding such as book or paper bronzing, gilding and edging, map and sample mounting.</p> <p>The production of composed type, prepared printing plates or cylinders, impressed lithographic stones or other impressed media for use in printing in another unit.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>The manufacture of type chests or typefaces are classified under group 3579. The production of printing media that have not been impressed is classified under an appropriate group by material.</p>
SIC 32600	Reproduction of recorded media	<p>This group includes the reproduction of records, audio, video and computer tapes from master copies, the reproduction of floppy, hard or compact disks, the reproduction of non-customised software and film duplicating.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>The reproduction of printed matter is classified under group 3251. The production on a fee or contract basis of intermediate products such as master records is classified under group 9649.</p>
SIC 37200	Manufacture of television and radio transmitters and apparatus for line telephony and line telegraphy	<p>This group includes the manufacture of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - apparatus for radio-broadcasting by means of electromagnetic waves without any line connection. The manufacture of apparatus for television transmission whether or not by line. Included is the manufacture of relay transmitters and television transmitters for industrial use; - transmission apparatus for radio-telephony, radio-telegraphy, whether or not incorporating reception apparatus or sound recording or reproducing apparatus: Fixed transmitters and transmitter-receivers, radio-telephony apparatus for transport equipment, radio-telephones, other

		<p>transponders, facsimile radio-telegraphic apparatus, etc;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - television cameras of all kinds; - and apparatus for line telephony or line telegraphy, including such apparatus for carrier-current line systems; reception apparatus for radio-telephony or radio telegraphy including apparatus combined with sound recording or reproducing apparatus or a clock. Included is the manufacture of telephone sets, automatic and non-automatic switchboards and exchanges; and Morse or Morse-type keys, other telegraphic transmitters, Morse-type recorders, printer-type receivers, picture telegraphic transmitters and receivers etc. <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The manufacture of general purpose parts (e.g. batteries or insulate wire) is classified under the appropriate group of Division 36 or under group 3710.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> <i>One is unsure as to whether this variable or the next should be included in the cultural indicator but it seems possible as they are the equipment needs of the film and television industry.</i></p>
SIC 3730	Manufacture of television and radio receivers, sound or video recording or reproducing apparatus and associated goods.	<p>This group includes the manufacture of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - television receivers (including video monitors and video projectors), whether or not combined in the same housing with radio-broadcast receivers or sound or video recording or reproducing apparatus; - reception apparatus for radio-broadcasting including apparatus with sound recording or reproducing apparatus or a clock; - magnetic tape recorders and other sound recording appliances, including those incorporating a sound reproducing device: Telephone answering machines, cassette-type recorders etc; - Video recording or reproducing apparatus;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Turntables (record decks), record players, cassette players and other sound reproducing apparatus; - Microphones, loudspeakers, headphones, earphones, amplifiers and sound amplifier sets, regardless of the particular purpose for which the apparatus may be designed; and - Specialised parts for the equipment resulting from the activities classified in this classification: pick-ups, tone arms, sound heads, tables for turn tables, record cutters, arials of all kinds and aerial reflectors and aerial rotors <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The manufacture of television cameras is classified under group 3720.</p>
SIC 883	Advertising	<p>This group includes the provision of advertising services. Advertising agency activities include creating and placing advertisements in periodicals and newspapers and on radio and television for clients. Included is the writing of advertising copy, commercial artwork and sign writing. Outdoor advertising, e.g. billboards, panels, window-dressing, showroom design, car and bus carding, etc. Media representation, i.e. the sale of time and space for various media soliciting advertising. Aerial advertising. The distribution or delivery of advertising material or samples. Also included is the renting of space for advertising.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The printing of advertising material is classified under group 325. Marketing research is classified under group 8813. The manufacture of advertising displays and number plates and signs is classified under subgroup 39294. Public relation activities are classified under group 8814. Direct mailing activities are classified under subgroup 88993. The production of commercial messages for radio, television and film are classified under the appropriate subgroup of major</p>

SIC 8894	Photographic activities	<p>group 961.</p> <p>This group includes all commercial and consumer photograph production, and the processing of photographs and motion pictures. Photograph production involves portrait photography, e.g. for passports, schools, weddings or other occasions (including by coin-operated cameras) and photography for commercials, publishers, fashion, real estate or tourism purposes, etc. Aerial photography is included. Film processing includes developing, printing and enlarging from client-taken negatives or motion pictures, whether for amateur photographers or for commercial clients. Also included is the mounting of slides and copying and restoring or transparency retouching in connection with old photographs. Also included is the production of video tape recording for consumers such as video tape recording at weddings.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>The processing of motion picture film related to the motion picture and television industries is classified under sub-group 96111.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><i>While the Philippines include personal pictures such as passport photos into their definition of culture, Canada did not do so. It is unclear the stance South Africa takes on this subject matter and it should be considered carefully.</i></p>
SIC 9611	Motion picture and video production and distribution	<p>This group includes the production of theatrical and non-theatrical motion pictures, whether on film or on videotape, for direct projection in theatres or for broadcasting on television. It usually involves production in a motion picture studio or in special laboratories for animated films or cartoons. These products may be full length theatrical films, documentaries, shorts, etc. for public entertainment, for advertising, education, training and news information, and religious films, animated cartoons or any kind, etc. Also included are auxiliary activities on a fee or contract basis such as film editing, cutting, dubbing, etc. The</p>

		<p>distribution of motion picture and videotapes to other industries, but not to the general public is also classified here. This involves the sale or rental of movies or tapes to other industries, and activities related to the distribution of films and video tapes such as film and tape booking, delivery, storage, etc.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> Film duplicating, and audio and videotape reproduction from master copies are classified under group 3260. Retail trade in tapes is classified under the appropriate subgroup of group 6233. Renting of tapes to the general public and renting of scenery and costumes are classified under group 8530. Film processing other than for the motion picture industry is classified under group 8894. Agency activities are classified under subgroup 88999. Production of films or tapes normally produced in television studios is classified under group 9613. Activities of own account actors, cartoonists, directors, consultants and other technical specialists, etc., are classified under group 9619.</p>
SIC 9612	Motion picture projection	<p>This group includes motion picture or videotape projection in theatres or in the open air, and in private screening rooms or other projection facilities.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The renting of videotapes and movies to the general public is classified under group 8530. Ticket agencies that sell admission tickets for motion picture or videotape projection on an agency basis are classified under group 9619.</p>
SIC 9613	Radio and television activities	<p>This group includes the production of radio and television programmes, whether live or on tape or other recording medium and whether or not combined with broadcasting. The programmes produced and broadcast may be for entertainment, for promotion, education, or training or news dissemination. The production of programmes generally results in a</p>

		<p>permanent tape which may be sold, rented or stored for broadcasting or rebroadcasting. Also included are productions such as sports coverage, weather forecasting, interviews etc.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> The transmission of cable television is classified under group 7520. Radio and television transmissions by relay or satellite are also classified under group 7520. Agency activities by agencies obtaining engagements on behalf of individuals in motion pictures, theatrical productions or other entertainment or sport attractions are classified under group 8899. The production of movies and videotapes in movie studios is classified under group 9611.</p>
SIC 9614	Dramatic arts, music and other arts activities	<p>This group includes the production, for the general public, of "live" theatrical presentations, concerts and opera or dance production and burlesque acts, whether set up for only a single attraction or multiple attractions. This can involve activities of groups or companies, orchestras or bands, but also of individual artists such as speakers, sculptors, painters, cartoonists, engravers, etchers, etc. related activities included here are, e.g., the operation of scenery and backdrops, lighting and sound equipments, concert and theatre halls and other facilities and the design of scenery and lighting.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> Agency activities by agencies obtaining engagements on behalf of individuals in motion pictures, theatrical productions or other entertainment or sport attractions are classified under group 8899. Casting activities are classified under group 9649. Ticket agencies that sell admission tickets for dramatic art and music presentations on an agency basis are classified under group 9619.</p>
SIC 9616	Other entertainment activities NEC	<p>This group includes the production of other kinds of entertainment not elsewhere classified such as the activities of ballrooms, discotheques and dance</p>

		<p>instructors, the activities of amusement parks and similar attractions, circus productions, puppet shows, rodeos, the activities of shooting galleries, etc. Also included are the activities of ticket agencies that sell admission tickets for motion pictures and videotape projection and for dramatic art, music and other presentations on an agency basis.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> Other recreational activities are classified under group 9649.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> <i>We are unsure if circus productions and rodeos are considered cultural, however they form a small component of the entire variable.</i></p>
SIC 9620	News agency activities	<p>This group includes news syndicates and news agency activities consisting of the provision of news, pictures, features to the media and news reporting services to newspapers, periodicals and radio and television broadcasters.</p>
SIC 9631	Library and archives activities	<p>This group includes a wide variety of documentation and information activities provided by libraries and archives. Activities of libraries of all kinds, reading, listening and viewing rooms, public archives, etc. this usually involves the organisation of a collection, whether specialised or not, the making of catalogues, the lending and storage of, e.g., books, maps, periodicals, films, records, tapes. The services may be provided to the general public or to a special clientele such as students, scientists, staff, members, etc.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u> Data based activities are classified under subgroup 86400.</p>
SIC 9632	Museum activities and preservation of historical sites and buildings	<p>This group includes the operation of museums of all kinds such as the art museums, museums of jewellery, furniture, costumes, ceramics, silverware, etc., natural history and science museums, technological museums, historical museums, including military museums and historic houses and all kinds of other specialised museums. Also included is the preservation of historical sites and</p>

SIC 9649	Other recreational activities	<p>buildings.</p> <p>This group includes all activities related to recreation not classified elsewhere under this division. This includes casting activities for motion pictures, television productions of theatre productions, the activities of booking agencies at which bookings are made for films, theatrical productions or other entertaining attractions, the recording or taping of sound (music, etc.) on a fee or contract basis; the activities of recreation parks and beaches (including the renting of facilities such as bathhouses, lockers, chairs, etc. activities related to recreational fishing, gambling and betting activities, fairs and shows of a recreational nature, recreational transport facilities (e.g. cableway transport at sightseeing places) etc.</p> <p><u>Exclusions:</u></p> <p>The training of dogs for security reasons is classified under group 8892.</p> <p>Agency activities by agencies obtaining engagements on behalf of individuals in motion pictures, theatrical productions or other entertainment or sport attractions are classified under group 8899.</p> <p>Other entertainment activities, e.g. circus productions or the activities of ballrooms, and discotheques are classified under group 9619.</p>
----------	-------------------------------	--

Source: Statistics South Africa: Standard Industrial Classification of all Economic Activities.

Assuming that the above list captures "culture", it would then be possible to find out its contribution to GDP. This information may be found in the "National Accounts". Essentially numerous firms are surveyed quarterly in order to compile the National Accounts and to come up with GDP figure. This data is however unavailable due to confidentiality reasons. It should however be possible to attain this information from Statistics South Africa. If it were the case, this indicator would then be a useful measure relative to other industries such as manufacturing, agriculture, mining etc.

Statistics South Africa has monthly releases that deal with various parts of the economy, for example the "Census of Manufacturing" and "Census of Agriculture" etc. Should the above National Accounts information not be available, Perhaps the solution would be to propose a "Census of Cultural Industries", a monthly or quarterly or even yearly release that collects, (if the classification exists but the data does not) compiles and incorporates the relevant cultural industrial data from all the major industrial divisions.

If this is also not viable, the next option would be to liaise with key industry players and collect data at regular intervals. While this may not be optimal, it does allow for trend analysis. Later on in the paper, there is the Canadian case where such an initiative became formalised by the "Culture Surveys Section". It manages the collection of data (and even administers eleven surveys) directly from cultural industries and institutions in Canada and distributes it to the public. This proves that it is not impossible to compile reliable statistics using regular surveys and questionnaires

Having looked at the statistics in South Africa and the problems encountered when collecting this data, we turn to international experience in the next section.

International Experience and Learning from International Experience

As mentioned previously, internationally culture is commanding more and more attention. This is obvious from the growing literature and theories on culture. With the growing attention, economists have found the need for more research into the culture and in particular the measurement of culture and its contribution to an economy. The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) is an important contributor to the challenging task of researching culture at an international level. It organised a seminar entitled "Measuring Culture and Development: Prospects and Limits of Constructing Cultural Indicators" and from it compiled and published the "World Culture Report" in 2000. It is from this report that most of this section is drawn.

There is an increasing demand for a wide range of indicators and statistics that cover activities and products, expenditure consumption, employment, finance, costs, prices etc. There are four reasons for this widespread popularity of indicators; (1) peer pressure, reviews and benchmarking, (2) transparency, (3) accountability and (4) international dialogue (Garonna, 2000, p.267). Peer pressure, reviews and benchmarking can be a very powerful policy tool in an information society, as it is able to induce response, stimulate reform and guide behaviour, however it does require clear and policy relevant indicators that are based on sound, comparable and credible statistics (Garonna, 2000, p. 268). Transparency in both cultural markets and institutions is required if one wishes to counter under-investment in culture; investment in culture often relies on acts of faith and/or eccentricity and more information is required to gain credibility, reduce risk, allocate resources and time efficiently and investment capital (Garonna, 2000). Under-investment in culture is largely due to the lack of accountability. Making governments more accountable for their actions is a precondition for support in the field of culture and arts (Garonna, 2000). Finally Garonna (2000, p.298) notes that international dialogue is important for cultural progress, but this exchange requires "high-quality statistics and indicators that can be compared and contrasted on the international level".

Garonna (2000, p.269) identifies three main challenges of cultural statistics and indicators:

- (1) *Establishment of a complete and integrated system of cultural statistics and indicators.* This is difficult in that it implies linking and networking many sources of data such as sample surveys, household surveys, registers and

population and housing censuses etc. while trying to improve data capturing processes.

- (2) *Creating trust.* Statistical information and transparency are required in order to generate trust and social capital, but trust and social capital are needed in order to generate good quality statistics. Hence there is a need for "trust between respondents and interviewers, between the public agency and the media and between policy makers and statisticians"; in other words a circular relationship. The role of national statistics institutes in the context of winning public confidence in cultural statistics is potentially very important and one should invest seriously in this through institutional reform and open communication.
- (3) *Measurement issues.* The third and perhaps most challenging issue arises not through lack of data, but due to conceptual inadequacy. There is awareness that cultural expenditure under certain conditions may be regarded as investments in social or human capital, and that certain cultural services could and should be regarded as products since they have economic value even though they are not exchanged in the market. Unfortunately these theoretical concepts have not yet been incorporated into operational ones for standard statistical measurements of output, assets and welfare. This means that governments may end up with contradictory policies. For example, "government may inject money into public monopolies and thus invest in public capital, while refusing to support the arts, which are regarded as revenue consuming".

Having looked at the broad challenges statisticians face, we now take a look at the different problems that various countries have experienced in collecting cultural data. The World Culture Report (2000) is a collection of essays from cultural researchers worldwide dealing with the cultural diversity, debates on culture, its policies and the measurement of culture. Like South Africa, the central problem that researchers in the rest of the world is clearly data related. It is important to realise that collection of data is easier than clearly defining and specifying what data should be collected. In Canada for example, the fundamental question involved asking "how wide to cast the net" (McPhie, 2000, p.259), in other words, what does one include when measuring culture and how in-depth should data collection be? This section tries to explore the problems encountered in data specification and collection that were experienced by the various countries. At the same time, parallels with the South African studies are drawn.

In terms of casting the net, Canada came to the conclusion that support structures were to be included due to their critical importance in the creation of cultural products as well as the role they play in distributing these products to consumers (McPhie, 2000). The Creative South Africa report also decided to incorporate support structures in their analysis for the same reason. The Canadian report adds up arts, culture, festivals to form total arts and cultural industries; thereafter heritage and supporting infrastructure is included to give an indication on the total cultural sector (McPhie, 2000). Each of these categories is further divided. "Arts" includes performing arts, visual arts and crafts, advertising, architecture, design and photography. "Cultural industries" consist of the print industry, film, broadcasting and music industry. "Heritage" incorporates museums and galleries and nature areas. Finally "Supporting infrastructure" is made up of arts and culture education and

government. Each of these in turn is broken down into (1) creation, (2) production, (3) manufacturing, (4) wholesale, (5) retail and (6) total (McGhee, 2000). It is clear at a glance, that while the South African study has identified most of the above categories, it does not measure all of them making it difficult for comparison. In terms of labour force estimates for the cultural industries, Canada notes that the further priority is to establish credibility for these numbers (McPhie, 2000, p.260). Like South Africa, Canada's Labour Force Survey does not provide such data. Canada does however have an official data collections unit called "Culture Surveys Section". It manages the collection of data directly from Canada's cultural industries and institutions and then releases the results to the public (McPhie, 2000, p.260). The Section also administers eleven surveys, maintains mailing lists and publishes results of the surveys etc. Even so, they acknowledge that more information and data is urgently needed to be collected on emerging issues such as "changes in the social sphere, world economy and in technology that are compounding both the complexity of the environment and the traditional exercise of gathering information to support it" (McPhie, 2000, p.262). This gives us an idea of how seriously the Canadians are taking culture and their ongoing evaluation and evolution of data collection methods.

The similar problem of defining cultural variables was also noted in the Philippines experience. While this is a question asked by many countries, there does not seem to be collaboration or sharing of the methodology used, i.e. there are distinctions in assumptions. For example, while the Canadian study decided that the sale of radios, instruments and CD players were not a reasonable measure of the viability of the music industry and as an extension of this passport photos neither, the Philippine report however includes photographs for passports and pictures taken at wedding etc as part of the cultural industries. Once again it is reiterated that caution should be exercised when comparing indices with inconsistencies. Another challenge was the fact that a significant part of cultural activities are in the non-monetary or informal economy sector (Laya, 2000). This also posed a problem for the South African report, particularly the craft industry. Even in the monetary sector, cultural activities are difficult to capture, for example an artist may not necessarily issue a receipt for his or her work. Also the question arises as to whether one should group critically acclaimed paintings and sculptures with tourist trade works (Laya, 2000, p.263). These questions are relevant in South Africa and should also be considered. The Philippine Standard Industrial Classification code is the basis for government statistical work on industry status and performance. South Africa has its own equivalent, but as mentioned earlier, the data is incomplete in that categories may exist but no data is available within that category. Philippines incorporates agricultural, hunting and fishing activities as cultural activities due to the fact that they form part of traditional communities (Laya, 2000). This is interesting as it illustrates that depending on how one defines culture, the broadness of what cultural industries could involve and further complicating the process of cross-country comparisons.

The Italians realised the need for comprehensive, comparable and accurate data. UNESCO played a fundamental role in the culture field and in particular two initiatives should draw particular attention. The first is the Leadership Group on Culture Statistics of the European Union (LEG), set up by Eurostat and led by the Italian National Institute of Statistics (Istat) with the participation of many statistical bureaux and ministries of culture of fourteen European countries (Garonna, 2000,

p.269). The objective was to define and draw up conditions for a system of cultural statistics that could be comparable at a European level. LEG focuses on the use of existing surveys (namely the labour force survey, the household budget survey, the multi-purpose social survey, and the main enterprise and governmental sector surveys) in order to get an overview and better insight into culture, participation and supply. This way they not only ensure in-depth data collection but also data classifications, concepts and indicators that have a common link allowing more comparative analysis. The second major initiative was the start of the Siena Group on Social Statistics in 1993 (Garonna, 2000). The Siena Group consisted of social statisticians from national statistics institutes, experts from ministries, academics and policy makers who work on measuring ethnicity and cultural or linguistic identity (Garonna, 2000, p.268). It may be seen that the first initiative deals with measuring those components that form the second or narrower definition of culture, while the Siena Group focuses on the first, broader definition of culture.

Other organisations are also beginning to integrate cultural statistics and account for them formally. For example, the UN's System of National Accounts (SNA) which consists of a "...consistent and integrated set of macroeconomic accounts... [that are] based on a set of internationally agreed concepts..." (SNA, 2001) has made considerable progress in the treatment of works of art, books, music and historical monuments in that they are considered and classified as produced intangible assets and included in gross capital formation (Garonna, 2000, p.270). This is an encouraging and positive sign. Although LEG is interested in a broad view of European culture etc. it would be useful for South Africa to contact and learn from them. Liaising closely with an organisation experienced and dedicated to cultural statistics would teach us: (1) what sort of cultural indicators are most illuminating and frequently used (2) how these indicators are defined, in other words what are they comprised/compiled of in order to make them comparable with the European measurements and (3) what source of data should be used and how to go about collecting the data if the need arose.

The experiences of many countries have shown that we are not alone in our struggles with cultural data. While South Africa has only recently been grappling with this issue, we have the luxury of learning valuable lessons from international experience and should take advantage of it.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The core issue, both internationally and locally has been to quantify culture, something that has proven to be more and more crucial in an economy. South Africa is facing the same statistical difficulties that other countries have in the past (and even today) in terms of gathering reliable and accurate cultural statistics.

To summarise, the problem with South African cultural statistics is threefold: (1) there is lack of data; there is no official source of data, (2) what data is available is fragmented due to the fact that there is no single source of data, and (3) different sources of data define and categories various industries differently making it hazardous to aggregate or compare these indicators.

There are several possible solutions to these data issues. The first is to obtain National Accounts data that is used to calculate total GDP and isolate culture specific

components to compile our own "culture's contribution to GDP". The second is to compile a cultural industry census much like the Census of Manufacturing that captures all manufacturing activity according to the Standard Industrial Classifications with StatsSA. This would ensure a single source of data that is complete and reliable. There would also be no problem of differing definitions etc.

The third possibility is to liaise with LEG and together develop a comprehensive data collection system for South Africa. This ensures that our classifications or definition of various industries are in line with that of Europe's. This would not only enable us to understand culture more but would make our indicators comparable internationally. Ideally after the liaison, South Africa should have a framework for a data set and be able to set up a Census of Cultural Industries, i.e. incorporating the first and second possibilities for a solution.

The last solution is to continue gathering data from key players in the industry, but in a formalised and more importantly consistent way. While this is not optimal, trends are useful in that they give an indication of the direction of movement of an industry.

Culture is an integral part of our lives and it is important to understand and promote its growth. While the task at hand seems impossible South Africa is fortunate to have the opportunity to learn from the experiences of other countries.

References:

- Grondona, M., (2000) "A Cultural Typology of Economic Development" in Huntington S.P. & Harrison, L.E., (Ed) (2000) Culture Matters, New York, Basic Books.
- Garonna, P., (2000) "Towards an International System of Cultural Statistics and Indicators: the Italian Experience in UNESCO (2000), World Culture Report, France, UNESCO Publishing
- Huntington, S.P., (2000) "Culture Counts" in Huntington S.P. & Harrison, L.E., (Ed) (2000) Culture Matters, New York, Basic Books.
- Kruger-Cloete, E., (2002) Implications of the information revolution for economic development in South Africa Project: Final Sectoral Report - Cultural Tourism Sector
- Landes, D., (2000) "Culture Makes almost all the Difference" in Huntington S.P. & Harrison, L.E., (Ed) (2000) Culture Matters, New York, Basic Books.
- Laya, J.C., (2000) "The Philippine approach to Cultural Statistics" in UNESCO (2000), World Culture Report, France, UNESCO Publishing
- Melo, D., (2002) Economics and Culture: Two Case Studies in Columbia from "Statistics in the Wake of Challenges Posed by Cultural Diversity in a Globalisation Context"
- McPhie, P., (2000) "Canada's National Culture Statistics Program: a Quarter Century of Development" in UNESCO (2000) World Culture Report, France, UNESCO Publishing
- Naumann, E., Hartzenberg, T., Mlatsheni, C., (2002) The MAPPP Sectors: A Brief Overview
- Naumann, E., Hartzenberg, T., Mlatsheni, C., (2002) The Tourism Sector: A brief overview

- Sen, A., (2001) Asian Values and Economic Growth from: www.unesco.org/culture/worldreport/html_eng/wcrb12.shtml
- Sen, A., (1997) Human Rights and Asian Values: What Lee Kuan Yew and Le Peng don't understand about Asia from: www.justpeace.org/sen.htm
- Sen, A., (2002) How does Culture Matter? (From forthcoming book: Culture and Public Action) www.cultureandpublication.org
- Throsby, D., (2002) The Cultural Workforce: Issues of Definition and Measurement from "Statistics in the Wake of Challenges Posed by Cultural Diversity in a Globalisation Context"
- The Cultural Strategy Group (CSG) (1998) "The South African Publishing Industry Report" in DACST (1998) Cultural Industries Growth Strategy. South Africa, DACST Publishing
- The Cultural Strategy Group (CSG) (1998) "The South African Craft Industry Report" in DACST (1998) Cultural Industries Growth Strategy. South Africa, DACST Publishing
- The Cultural Strategy Group (CSG) (1998) "The South African Film and Television Industry Report" in DACST (1998) Cultural Industries Growth Strategy. South Africa, DACST Publishing
- The Cultural Strategy Group (CSG) (1998) "The South African Music Industry Report" in DACST (1998) Cultural Industries Growth Strategy. South Africa, DACST Publishing

Appendix A

Table A1: Age by Occupation - Census 1996

Age by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
15 - 19 yrs	1,296	3,799	5,095
20 - 24 yrs	8,003	23,195	31,198
25 - 29 yrs	11,442	37,276	48,718
30 - 34 yrs	12,242	39,214	51,456
35 - 39 yrs	10,918	32,790	43,708
40 - 44 yrs	8,863	25,257	34,120
45 - 49 yrs	6,663	17,334	23,997
50 - 54 yrs	4,411	11,210	15,621
55 - 59 yrs	2,807	6,916	9,723
60 - 64 yrs	1,237	3,136	4,373
65 - 69 yrs	465	1,086	1,551
70 - 74 yrs	135	341	476
75 - 79 yrs	61	170	231
80 - 84 yrs	25	61	86
85 and above	28	60	88
Unspecified			
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441

Table A2: Geographical areas by Occupation - Census 1996

Geographical areas by Occupation for Weighted person	Handicraft, printing and related trades workers	Other craft and related trades workers	Total
Western Cape	13,832	33,162	46,994
Eastern Cape	4,872	19,682	24,554
Northern Cape	1,118	3,674	4,792
Free State	2,941	19,120	22,061
KwaZulu-Natal	9,970	41,559	51,529
North West	7,216	24,360	31,576
Gauteng	29,200	57,463	86,663
Mpumalanga	3,228	12,636	15,864
Northern Province	2,908	9,458	12,366
Total	68,596	201,845	270,441